

**IMPACT OF THE PRIMARY MARKET ON ECONOMIC
GROWTH, PRODUCTIVITY AND ENTREPRENEURSHIP:
A CROSS COUNTRY ANALYSIS**



सिद्धिमूलं प्रबन्धनम्
भा. प्र. सं. इन्दौर
IIM INDORE
A THESIS

SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE
FELLOW PROGRAMME IN MANAGEMENT
INDIAN INSTITUTE OF MANAGEMENT
INDORE

By

(Vinod Kumar)

FPM, 2012 Batch (Finance & Accounting)

Date: -----

Thesis Advisory Committee

Prof. Ganesh Kumar Nidugala (Chair)

[.....]

Prof. K. Kiran Kumar (Member)

Prof. Radha Mukesh Ladkani (Member)

[.....]

[.....]

ABSTRACT

The Primary equity market (Primary market) motivates adoption of new technologies and promotes business through entrepreneurs, contributing to economic development. Economic growth theories postulate that economic growth and development happens through two routes - factor accumulation and factor productivity. Schumpeter (1911) argued that credit is essential for entrepreneurship and further entrepreneurship leads to innovation absorption, productivity improvement and economic growth. McKinnon (1973) contended that financial development leads to accumulation of entrepreneurial capital and thereby drives growth in developing countries. While Schumpeter (1911) argued in support of the role of entrepreneurs in the factor productivity route of growth, McKinnon (1973) stressed on the role of entrepreneurs in the capital accumulation route of growth. Literature provides empirical evidence in support of the roles of Banks and the Stock Market in economic growth, total factor productivity (TFP) growth and entrepreneurial growth. However, to the best of our knowledge, only one study is available (Andriansyah, et al. 2014) which examines the Primary market-Growth relationship. However, he did not use all available data on Primary market. We could not find any empirical study on the role of Primary market in TFP and Entrepreneurship. This study aims to fill this gap.

We empirically examined major arguments of Schumpeter (1911) related to impact of entrepreneurial finance on entrepreneurship, growth and productivity. Further, we examined the arguments of classical economics and McKinnon (1973) on Finance-Growth/TFP relationship. We tested whether the 2008 financial crisis weakened the Primary market-economic growth relationship.

Responses to the first set of research questions on Primary market-Growth relationship reveal that growth in Primary market impacts economic growth in general. The relationship is stronger in lower income economies (as classified by World Bank) and in higher inflation (CPI inflation >5%) economies. The impact of Primary market on growth in high income economies is weak. The Primary market-growth relationship is not affected by the 2008 financial crisis. Also, causality runs from Primary market to economic growth and not the other way around.

From responses to the second set of research questions, we find that Primary market-TFP relationship is positive and strong. The relationship is not affected by income level and inflation. We further found that Primary market drives non-TFP growth in low income economies (McKinnon, 1973) but has no impact on high income economies (Classical). The Primary market-TFP relationship is not affected by the 2008 financial crisis. Causality runs from Primary market to TFP and not from TFP to Primary market.

Responses to the third set of research questions on Primary market-entrepreneurship relationship reveal that Primary market-TEA (total entrepreneurship activity as defined by global entrepreneurship monitor) relationship follows Schumpeter's hypothesis in high income economies, but the IPO-TEA relationship is found negative in lower income economies. Our analysis suggests that the relationship between TEA and Primary market is quadratic in Primary market. The magnitude of coefficient of square term increases with income level and that of linear term decreases with income level. This, coupled with the fact that the size of Primary market rises with income level of economies, explains why Primary market-TEA relationship is positive in

high income economies and negative in low income economies. To solve the puzzle of the negative relationship between Primary market-TEA in lower income economies, we further explored the relationship of Primary market with Schumpeterian 'innovation driven' entrepreneurs and non-Schumpeterian 'forced entrepreneurs'. The findings suggest that Primary market has positive and significant relationship with Schumpeterian entrepreneurs in all economies, and negative relationship with non-Schumpeterian entrepreneurs. Higher ratio of non-Schumpeterian entrepreneurs in low income economies explains the negative relationship between Primary market and TEA. However, component of non-Schumpeterian entrepreneurs decreases with increasing Primary market and Growth.

In conclusion, our result suggests that Primary market-economic growth relationship follows Schumpeter (1911) model. Further, Schumpeter (1911) and Classical, McKinnon (1973) models are complementary in explaining the Primary market-Growth relationship.

The role of Primary market in TFP growth and innovation driven entrepreneurship has policy implication for all countries, and its role in capital accumulation driven growth has implications for lower income countries. The Primary market, as leading indicator of Growth, is useful for portfolio management.

Table of content

1.	Introduction.....	14
1.1.	Literature Review.....	17
1.1.1.	Financial market development and economic growth	17
1.1.2.	Financial development and Factor Productivity	32
1.1.3.	Financial development, Growth, Productivity and Entrepreneurship	33
1.1.4.	Equity Market, Economic Growth and Factor Productivity	34
1.2.	Motivation, Research Objectives and Contribution	36
2.1.	ESSAY 1: Impact of Primary Market on Economic Growth: A Cross Country Analysis	42
2.1.1	Introduction.....	42
2.1.1.1	Primary market and Economic Growth.....	44
2.1.1.2	Primary equity capital market and Global Trend.....	49
2.1.2	Methodology	52
2.1.3.	Description of Data and Descriptive Statistics.....	57
2.1.4.	Initial tests before final estimation of Model parameters.....	58
2.1.5	Results and Analysis	62
2.1.5.1	Panel IV Regression output.....	62
2.1.5.2.	Estimation using GMM technique	64
2.1.5.3	Supply leading or demand following hypothesis	70
2.1.5.4.	Panel Vector Autoregression (Panel-VAR)	71
2.1.5.5.	Long Run Propensity (LRP) of financial market on Growth	72
2.1.5.6.	Robustness of Primary market-Growth relationship.....	74
2.1.5.7.	Cointegration test between GDP-IPO	75
2.1.5.8.	Further test for Primary-economic growth relationship:.....	75
2.1.5.9.	Other robustness test: Quantile regression.....	78
2.2.	Impact of Primary Market on Industrial Sector Growth	80
2.2.1.	Introduction.....	80
2.2.2.	Methodology	80
2.2.3.	Description of Data	80
2.2.4.	Initial test and analysis.....	81
2.2.5.	Results and Analysis	82
2.2.5.1	Panel instrument variable regression result.....	82

2.2.5.2	GMM estimation result	84
2.2.5.3.	Supply-leading or demand-following arguments.....	89
2.2.5.4.	Causality Test: Panel Vector Autoregression (Panel-VAR)	89
2.2.5.5	Long Run Propensity (LRP) of Primary market on IVA	90
2.2.5.6.	Cointegration test:	91
2.2.5.7.	Further test for Primary-IVA relationship: testing causal relation.....	92
2.2.5.8.	Quantile regression	93
2.3.	Impact of Primary Market on Manufacturing Sector growth	96
2.3.1.	Introduction.....	96
2.3.2.	Methodology	96
2.3.3.	Description of Data	96
2.3.4.	Initial tests on data and model.....	97
2.3.5.	Result and Analysis.....	98
2.3.5.1	Panel instrument variable regression result.....	98
2.3.5.2.	GMM Estimation for Primary market-MVA relationship	99
2.3.5.3	Supply-leading or demand-following argument	105
2.3.5.4.	Causality Test: Panel Vector Autoregression (Panel-VAR)	106
2.3.5.5	Long Run Propensity (LRP) of Primary market on MVA	107
2.3.5.6	Cointegration test	107
2.3.5.7	Further test for Primary market-MVA relationship: causal relation	108
2.3.5.8	Quantile regression	109
2.4.	Impact of Primary Market on Service Sector Growth	112
2.4.1.	Introduction.....	112
2.4.2.	Methodology	112
2.4.3.	Description of Data	112
2.4.4.	Initial tests on data	113
2.4.5.	Result and Analysis.....	114
2.4.5.1	Panel -IV Regression result.....	114
2.4.5.2.	GMM Estimation for Primary market - SVA relationship.....	116
2.4.5.3.	Supply-leading or demand-following arguments.....	121
2.4.5.4.	Causality Test: Panel Vector Autoregression (Panel-VAR)	122
2.4.5.5.	Long Run Propensity (LRP) of Primary market on SVA	123
2.4.5.6.	Cointegration test	123
2.4.5.7.	Further test for Primary-SVA relationship: testing causal relation.....	124

2.4.5.8.	Quantile regression	125
2.5.1.	Discussion and analysis	126
2.5.2.	Discussion on other issues	131
2.5.3.	Limitation of study.....	133
2.5.4.	Conclusion	134
2.5.5.	Policy implication	135
2.5.6.	Further research	136
2.5.7.	References.....	136
2.5.13	ANNEXURES	143
2.5.13.1.	Annexure 1: Summary of Primary market (1990-2014) of select countries	143
2.5.13.2.	Annexure 2.....	146
2.5.13.3	Annexure 3.....	147
3.	ESSAY 2: Impact of Primary Market on Factor productivity, and an “IPO-TFP-Growth Puzzle”: A Cross Country Analysis	149
3.1	Introduction.....	149
3.1.1	Primary market and TFP: Data and trend	151
3.2.	Methodology	153
3.3.	Description of Data.....	153
3.4.	Initial tests on data to finalize model	155
3.5.	Result and Analysis.....	157
3.5.1.	Impact of Income level and inflation on Primary-TFP relationship	161
3.5.2.	Supply-leading or demand-following hypothesis	164
3.5.3.	Causality Test: Panel Vector Autoregression (Panel-VAR)	165
3.5.4.	Long Run Propensity (LRP) of financial market on TFP	166
3.5.5.	Robustness of result	168
3.5.6.	Cointegration test.....	168
3.5.7.	Supply-leading or demand-following: differenced variables.....	169
3.6.	New IPO-TFP-Growth Puzzle: path and goal mismatch in Schumpeter?	170
3.6.1.	Discussion on the puzzle.....	171
3.7.	Further Discussion and Conclusion	177
3.8	Policy implication	180
3.9	Limitations of the study	180
3.10.	Future research direction.....	181

3.11.	References.....	182
3.12.	ANNEXURES	185
3.12.1.	Annexure 1: List of countries and summary for countries in study	185
3.12.2.	Annexure 2: Year wise summary of key variables	186
3.12.3.	Annexure 3: Top 25 economies in TFP growth and Primary market	187
4.	ESSAY 3: Impact of Primary Market on Entrepreneurial Activity, and an “IPO-Entrepreneurship-TFP-Growth Puzzle”: A Cross Country Study	189
4.1	Introduction.....	189
4.1.1.	Entrepreneurship Data and trend.....	191
4.2.	Methodology	195
4.3.	Description of Data	198
4.4.	Initial tests on data	200
4.4.1.	Endogeneity Test	201
4.4.2.	Other pre-estimation diagnostic tests.....	201
4.5.	Result and Analysis.....	204
4.5.1.	Panel fixed effect Regression result.....	204
4.5.2.	GMM Estimation Result: TEA-Primary relationship	208
4.5.3.	Further test for robustness of IPO-TFP relationship	213
4.6.	An IPO-Entrepreneurship-TFP-Growth Puzzle: path and goal mismatch in Schumpeter?.....	214
4.6.1	The IPO-Entrepreneurship-Growth Puzzle	215
4.6.2.	Examining the puzzle.....	216
4.6.3.	Data analysis for IPO-TEA-TFP-Growth puzzle: with formal entrepreneurship data.....	223
4.7.	Discussion and Conclusion	226
4.8.	Policy implication	228
4.9.	Limitation.....	228
4.10.	Further research directions.....	229
4.11.	References.....	230
4.12.	ANNEXURES	232
4.12.1.	Annexure 1: list of countries in our sample study.....	232
4.12.2.	Annexure 2: year wise summary of key variables	233
5.	Conclusion & Summary.....	235

List of tables

Essay 1 Table 1: Summary of Primary market (1990-2014) of sample countries (US \$)	51
Essay 1 Table 2: Descriptive statistics: summary of data	57
Essay 1 Table 3: Correlation matrix of PGDP, Primary, Stock, and Bank	58
Essay 1 Table 4: Unit root test (PGDP, IVA, MVA, SVA, Primary, Stock, Bank)	59
Essay 1 Table 5: Endogeneity Test result	59
Essay 1 Table 6: Diagnostic test of the model and data	61
Essay 1 Table 7: Panel IV regression estimates with cluster robust estimates	63
Essay 1 Table 8: Difference GMM Results on Finance-Growth relationship	65
Essay 1 Table 9: System GMM output on Finance-Growth relationship	67
Essay 1 Table 10: Income level effect on IPO-Growth relationship (System GMM)	70
Essay 1 Table 11: System GMM Results for structural relationship	71
Essay 1 Table 12: Panel-Vector Auto-Regression (Panel VAR) result	72
Essay 1 Table 13: Long Run Propensity estimates of financial market on Growth	73
Essay 1 Table 14: Pedroni cointegration Test	75
Essay 1 Table 15: Structural relationship in finance-growth nexus	76
Essay 1 Table 16: Panel VAR (GDP, Primary, Stock, Bank) in differenced variables	77
Essay 1 Table 17: Quantile regression for pooled data	78
Essay 1 Table 18: Summary statistics for IPO-IVA relationship	81
Essay 1 Table 19 and 19a: Correlation and partial correlation matrix	81
Essay 1 Table 20: Panel IV regression output summary for IVA-Primary market	83
Essay 1 Table 21: Difference GMM output for IVA-Finance relationship	85
Essay 1 Table 22: System GMM output for IVA-Primary relationship	87
Essay 1 Table 23: Income Level effect on Primary market-IVA relationship	88
Essay 1 Table 24: Supply-leading or demand-following	89
Essay 1 Table 25: Panel VAR result for IVA-Primary growth relationship	90
Essay 1 Table 26: Long Run Propensity of financial market effect on IVA	90
Essay 1 Table 27: Pedroni cointegration Test IPO-IVA	91
Essay 1 Table 28: Structural relationship in Finance-IVA growth	93
Essay 1 Table 29: Quantile regression output (non-dynamic and pooled)	94
Essay 1 Table 30: Summary statistics on IPO-MVA	97
Essay 1 Table 31 and 31a: Correlation and partial correlation matrix	97
Essay 1 Table 32: Panel instrument variable regression MVA-Primary market	99
Essay 1 Table 33: Primary market- MVA relationship: Difference GMM output	101
Essay 1 Table 34: Primary market- MVA relationship: System GMM output	102
Essay 1 Table 35: Primary market impact country income wise (difference GMM)	104
Essay 1 Table 36: Primary market impact country income wise (system GMM)	104
Essay 1 Table 37: Supply leading or demand following (MVA-Primary)	105
Essay 1 Table 38: Panel VAR result for MVA-Primary growth relationship	106
Essay 1 Table 39: Long Run Propensity estimates of financial market on Growth	107
Essay 1 Table 40: Pedroni cointegration test on MVA-IPO relationship	108
Essay 1 Table 41: Structural relationship in Finance-MVA	109
Essay 1 Table 42: Quantile regression output (non-dynamic and pooled)	112
Essay 1 Table 43: Summary statistics of SVA-Primary market relationship	112
Essay 1 Table 44 and 44a: Correlation and partial correlation matrix	113
Essay 1 Table 45: Panel Instrument variable regression SVA-Primary market	115

Essay 1 Table 46: Primary market- SVA relationship: Difference GMM output	116
Essay 1 Table 47: Primary market- SVA relationship: System GMM output	119
Essay 1 Table 48: Impact of income level on Primary-SVA relationship (difference GMM)	120
Essay 1 Table 49: Impact of income level on Primary-SVA relationship (System GMM)	121
Essay 1 Table 50: Testing Supply leading or demand following arguments (SVA-IPO)	121
Essay 1 Table 51: Panel VAR result for SVA-Primary growth relationship	123
Essay 1 Table 52: Long Run Propensity (LRP) of financial market on SVA	123
Essay 1 Table 53: Pedroni cointegration test for SVA-IPO	124
Essay 1 Table 54: Structural relationship in Finance-SVA growth	125
Essay 1 Table 55: Quantile regression	126
Essay 1 Table 56: Primary-Growth relationship in non-H and H economies	128
Essay 1 Table 57: Primary-Growth relationship in 5% +/- inflation economies	130
Essay 2 Table 1: Source of data used in the study	152
Essay 2 Table 2: Summary statistics (for sample)	154
Essay 2 Table 3 and 3a: Correlation and partial correlation matrix	154
Essay 2 Table 4: Fisher Type unit root Unit root test	155
Essay 2 Table 5: Endogeneity Test	155
Essay 2 Table 6: Diagnostic test results (Dep.var. = TFP)	157
Essay 2 Table 7: Estimate with 5 additional control variables	158
Essay 2 Table 8: TFP-Primary market relationship (Difference GMM output)	159
Essay 2 Table 9: TFP-Primary market relationship (System GMM output)	161
Essay 2 Table 10: Impact of income level on Primary-TFP relationship (Difference GMM)	163
Essay 2 Table 11: Impact of income level on Primary-TFP relationship (System GMM)	163
Essay 2 Table 12: Primary-TFP relationship (winsorized data and changed control)	164
Essay 2 Table 13: Supply leading or demand following arguments (Level variables)	165
Essay 2 Table 14: Pane VAR on TFP-IPO relationship	166
Essay 2 Table 15: Long run propensity in Primary-TFP relationship	167
Essay 2 Table 16: Cointegration Test on TFP-Primary relationship	168
Essay 2 Table 17: Structural relationship in finance-growth nexus	169
Essay 2 Table 18: TFP and non-TFP growth summary	176
Essay 2 Table 19: GMM output on Growth-IPO-TFP relationship	177
Essay 3 Table 1: Source of data used in the study	192
Essay 3 Table 2: Description of Data on Entrepreneurship model	198
Essay 3 Table 3: Sample correlation in variables in Entrepreneurship model	198
Essay 3 Table 3a: Sample Partial correlation in variables in Entrepreneurship model	199
Essay 3 Table 3b: Sample Partial correlation in variables for only U and H dataset	200
Essay 3 Table 3c: Sample Partial correlation in variables for only H dataset	200
Essay 3 Table 4: Fisher Type unit root Unit root test	201
Essay 3 Table 5: Endogeneity Test result	201
Essay 3 Table 6: Pre estimate test results for TEA-Primary model	204
Essay 3 Table 7: Panel regression result for TEA-Primary market relationship	205
Essay 3 Table 8: Panel fixed effect estimator for TEA-Primary relationship	207
Essay 3 Table 9: Difference GMM output for TEA-Primary market relationship	209
Essay 3 Table 10: System GMM output for TEA-Primary market relationship	210
Essay 3 Table 11: Inflation and income level impact on Primary-TEA relationship	210
Essay 3 Table 12: Interaction TEA with high Income in IPO-Growth relationship	212

Essay 3 Table 13: One step GMM estimates assuming variables non-endogenous	213
Essay 3 Table 14: One step GMM estimates assuming key variables endogenous	214
Essay 3 Table 15: IPO-TEA-Growth Puzzle	215
Essay 3 Table 15: Primary market-Formal entrepreneurship relationship: System GMM	225

List of figures

Figure 1: Trend in IPO market	52
Figure 2: IPO vs. GDP growth	52
Figure 3 and 3a: TFP vs. GDP growth	152
Figure 4 : IPO-TFP graph	152
Figure 5: IPO-TFP graph (made curve closer)	153
Figure 6: IPO-TFP-Growth Puzzle	170
Figure 7: Overall-GDP vs. TFP	175
Figure 8: Overall-GDP vs TFP	175
Figure 9: GDP vs. TFP (H economies)	175
Figure 10: GDP vs.TFP (non-H economies)	175
Figure 11: TEA vs. GDP/Capita relationship	193
Figure 12: TEA vs. GDP/Capita relationship (H only)	194
Figure 13: TEA vs. Primary/GDP relationship	194
Figure 14: TEA vs. Primary/GDP relationship (H only)	194
Figure 15: TEA, GDP and Primary market data	195
Figure 16: TEA, GDP and Primary market data (H only)	195
Figure 17: IPO-TEA-Growth Puzzle	215
Figure 18: Pictorial representation of the key relationship	215

Acronyms used

1. IPO = Initial Public Offering; but in this thesis, IPO stands for “all Primary market issues”.
2. GDP= Gross Domestic Product of a country
3. PGDP= GDP/capita
4. IVA= Industry Value Added; but in this thesis, is used for IVA/capita also.
5. MVA= Manufacturing Value Added; but in this thesis, is used for MVA/capita also.
6. SVA= Service Value Added; but in this thesis, is used for SVA/capita also.
7. TFP= Total Factor Productivity, as defined in economic growth theory
8. TEA= Total Entrepreneurship Activity as percentage of working age population
9. LLC= Number of Limited Liability Companies registered in a year.
10. L, LM, UM, H category= Low income country, lower middle income country, upper middle income country, higher income country respectively

Variable definition (acronym)

(All data are annual series)

1. **Gross domestic product (GDP)** - It is the total production of goods and services in the economy in a year. The proxy used is lag of annual GDP.
2. **Economic growth per capita (PGDP)** - This is the proxy for economic growth in the economic models estimated. This is measured by natural log of annual GDP divided by total population so that difference in the variable represents percentage growth.
3. **Primary equity market (Primary/primary market/IPO)** - This is proxy for primary equity market. In the estimated model, proxy for Primary market includes all kinds of actual priced and issued primary capital, divided by lagged GDP. The data is taken from Thomson Reuter's. Doidge (2013) argued that coverage of Thomson Reuters for global primary market is complete.
4. **Stock market (STOCK)** - This is proxy for secondary equity market. The proxy is total traded value of equity as percentage of GDP.
5. **Banking development (BANK)** - This is proxy for Banking development. The proxy is total private credit as percentage of GDP.
6. **Industrial value added (IVA)** - This is proxy for industrial sector development. The proxy is natural log of total industrial value added (as provided by World Bank WDI database) per capita.
7. **Manufacturing value added (MVA)** - This is proxy for manufacturing sector development. The proxy is natural log of total manufacturing value added (as provided by World Bank) per capita.
8. **Service value added (SVA)** - This is proxy for service sector development. The proxy is natural log of total service value added (provided by World Bank) per capita.
9. **Total factor productivity (TFP)** - It accounts for the economic growth not explained by capital accumulation and labour inputs accumulation. The data is taken from Conference Board TED dataset.
10. **Total entrepreneurship activity (TEA)** - It is proxy for entrepreneurship activity in a country. The proxy is total entrepreneurial activity as percentage of working age population. The data is taken from Global entrepreneurship monitor database.
11. **Limited liability companies (LLC)** - The data is the number of all companies listed as limited liability companies. The data is provided by World Bank.
12. **GINI** – It is a measure of income inequality. Data is provided by World Bank.
13. **Patent** – It is proxy for innovation in an economy. The data includes patent of both resident and non-resident citizens. Data is provided by World Bank.
14. **Income categories.** World Bank publishes classification of various countries based on the income level of the country. World Bank divides countries in 4 income groups, lower income countries (L), lower middle income countries (LM), upper middle income countries (UM), and high income countries (H). We used non-H countries or lower income countries for L, LM and UM countries jointly.