

**A STUDY OF IMPACTS OF INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY INVESTMENT ON
ORGANIZATIONAL OUTCOMES IN INDIAN CONTEXT**



A Doctoral Dissertation Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Fellow Programme in Management

Indian Institute of Management Indore

By
Gaurav Dixit

Submitted in
March 2014

Thesis Advisory Committee:

Prof. Prabin Panigrahi
(Chair)

Prof. Sanjog Ray
(Member)

Prof. Ganesh Kumar Nidugala
(Member)

ABSTRACT

Businesses have been spending huge sums of money on computers, software, and other related expenses as a major part of their Information Technology (IT) investment for many years. This trend has been going on for past three decades in US and has caught up with India as well in recent times. Though IT sector has been driving the GDP growth of India for past decade, IT adoption in many segments of Indian industry still remains a recent phenomenon. Even though IT investments have increased considerably, the impact of IT investments on organizational outcome variables remains tenuous. Prior research also notices a varying range of performance outcomes of IT investments among different firms. This has been attributed to contingent effect of IT investment by Information Systems (IS) researchers. Thus, using IT to enable a firm to achieve the desired organizational change and reaping benefits thereof still remains a challenge for managers.

Prior studies have documented several financial, operational, strategic, administrative, and other benefits of IT investment. It is very important for organizations to find out which of these benefits are realised later. Research related to the impact of IT investment in Indian context is very limited. In view of the importance of the research in this field and the existing research gap, this study explores the impact of IT investment on Indian firms. Specifically, the study focuses on the impact of IT investment on three organizational variables that are cost of operations, profit, and capital productivity. Following the contingency theory perspective, these relationships are also examined in presence of contingent contextual variables like firm age, export activity, firm ownership, financial leverage, sales growth, industry competitiveness, board independence, foreign ownership, management remuneration, and absorptive capacity.

The current research adopts quantitative research methodology to address its objectives. The relationships are tested and analyzed using structural equation modelling (SEM) technique. The data of Indian firms covering the period of 2007-2010 have been used in this study.

Results of the study reveal that Indian firms are yet to achieve some of the well-popularised benefits of IT. It was found that IT investment has helped Indian firms in reducing cost of operations, but firms have witnessed drop in profit and capital productivity. Firms in early period of their life benefit more from IT in reducing their cost of operations and firms in operation for a relatively long period benefit more from IT in increasing their profit. Firms with relatively higher exports benefit more from IT in increasing their profit and improving their capital productivity and firms with relatively low exports benefit more from IT in reducing their cost of operations. State-owned enterprises (SOE) benefit more from IT in reducing their cost of operations as compared to privately-owned enterprises (POE) and foreign-invested enterprises (FIE). SOEs, FIEs, and POEs benefit from IT in improving their profit in that increasing order. Firms with relatively high debt levels benefit less from IT in reducing their cost of operations. Firms with relatively high sales growth benefit less from IT in reducing their cost of operations. Firms, which operate in a relatively more competitive industry benefit more from IT in reducing their cost of operations, and firms, which operate in a relatively less competitive industry, benefit more from IT in increasing their profit. Time to realize the benefits from IT investment has come down to 1 year from 2-3 years. Finally, evidence obtained in this study suggests that impact of IT can be either context-dependent, or context-independent depending on the organizational outcome under consideration for impact.

The contribution of this study lies in presenting the 'IT impact model' considering both direct and indirect time-lagged effects of IT investment on some key but related

organizational variables simultaneously and evaluating the relationships among the variables in the models. The study also contributes by investigating the role of various contextual variables on realizing payoffs from IT investment and thus extends the IT impact theory. The study is set in India and adds to the scarce research in an emerging economy in this domain of IS research.

The findings of this study highlight the wide gaps that exist between theory and practice in achieving IT benefits, such as profitability and productivity gains. The results point out that Indian firms are yet to achieve some of the well-popularised benefits of IT. This study presents them some managerial tasks to contend.

Keywords: IT investment, IT impact, Contingency theory perspective, Structural equation modelling, Indian firms.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
ABSTRACT	iii
LIST OF TABLES	xi
LIST OF FIGURES	xiii
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	xiv
CHAPTER 1—INTRODUCTION	1
CHAPTER 2—LITERATURE REVIEW	10
Information Technology	10
IT Investment	10
IT Investment Trends	11
Impact of IT investment	13
IT Impact Studies Related to Performance	14
IT Impact Studies Related to Productivity	17
IT Impact Studies Related to Cost	21
IT Impact Studies Related to Quality	23
IT Impact Studies Related to Efficiency	24
IT Impact Studies Related to Profit	26
IT Impact Studies Related to Market Value	27

IT Impact Studies in Indian Context	29
Research Gap A	30
Definition of Terms	30
Research Hypotheses	32
Cost of Operations	32
Profit	34
Capital Productivity	36
Contingency Theory Perspective in IT Context	38
Research Gap B	41
Definition of Terms (Contextual Variables)	41
Research Hypotheses (Contextual Variables)	45
Firm Age	45
Export Activity	47
Firm Ownership	48
Financial Leverage	51
Sales Growth	52
Industry Competitiveness	53
Board Independence	54
Management Remuneration	56

Foreign Ownership	57
Absorptive Capacity	58
Control Variables	59
Conceptual Models	60
CHAPTER 3—METHOD	63
Data Set	63
Measurement	67
IT Investment	67
Cost of Operations	68
Profit	69
Capital Productivity	69
Firm Age	70
Export Activity	70
Firm Ownership	71
Financial Leverage	71
Sales Growth	71
Industry Competitiveness	72
Board Independence	72
Management Remuneration	73

Foreign Ownership	74
Absorptive Capacity	74
Firm Size	74
Industry	75
Model	75
CHAPTER 4—RESULTS AND DISCUSSION	78
Model 1 (IT Impact Model without Moderator)	78
Model 2 (IT Impact Model with Firm Age)	81
Model 3 (IT Impact Model with Export Activity)	84
Model 4 (IT Impact Model with Firm ownership)	87
Model 5 (IT Impact Model with Financial Leverage)	90
Model 6 (IT Impact Model with Sales Growth)	92
Model 7 (IT Impact Model with Industry Competitiveness)	95
Key Findings	100
Theoretical Contributions	102
CHAPTER 5—CONCLUSION	103
Practical Implications	103
Limitations of the Study	104
Scope for Future Research	104

REFERENCES	106
APPENDICES	
A. IT Impact Model Test Using Data of Latest Period (2010-2013)	135
B. IT Impact Model Test Using Reduced Data	137

LIST OF TABLES

	PAGE
Table 1. IT Spending by Sector, Worldwide, 2010 through 2016 (Billions of U.S. Dollars)	12
Table 2. Indian IT Infrastructure Revenue by Technology (Millions of U.S. Dollars)	13
Table 3. Relevant IT Impact Studies on Productivity Related Factors	21
Table 4. Relevant IT Impact Studies on Cost Related Factors	22
Table 5. Relevant IT Impact Studies on Profit Related Factors	27
Table 6. List of Moderators Used in IT Context	41
Table 7. Model Details	65
Table 8. Sample Size Details	66
Table 9. Distribution of Firms by Industry Section	67
Table 10. Indicators of IT Investment	68
Table 11. Indicators of Firm Profitability	70
Table 12. Indicators of Export Activity	71
Table 13. Indicators of Industry Competitiveness	72
Table 14. Indicators of Board Independence	73
Table 15. Indicators of Absorptive Capacity	74
Table 16. Goodness-of-fit (GOF) Measures for Model 1	78
Table 17. Model 1 Test Results	79

Table 18. Goodness-of-fit (GOF) Measures for Model 2	82
Table 19. Model 2 Test Results	82
Table 20. Goodness-of-fit (GOF) Measures for Model 3	84
Table 21. Model 3 Test Results	85
Table 22. Goodness-of-fit (GOF) Measures for Model 4	87
Table 23. Model 4 Test Results	88
Table 24. Goodness-of-fit (GOF) Measures for Model 5	90
Table 25. Model 5 Test Results	91
Table 26. Goodness-of-fit (GOF) Measures for Model 6	93
Table 27. Model 6 Test Results	94
Table 28. Goodness-of-fit (GOF) Measures for Model 7	96
Table 29. Model 7 Test Results	96
Table 30. Hypotheses Results	98
Table 31. Goodness-of-fit (GOF) Measures for Appendix A Model	135
Table 32. Appendix A Model Test Results	136
Table 33. Goodness-of-fit (GOF) Measures for Appendix B Model	137
Table 34. Appendix B Model Test Results	138

LIST OF FIGURES

	PAGE
Figure 1. Basic conceptual model	9
Figure 2. IT impact model (without a contextual variable)	60
Figure 3. IT impact model (with a contextual variable)	62