

LINKAGES BETWEEN REGIONAL TRADE AGREEMENTS AND ENVIRONMENTAL AND LABOUR MARKET OUTCOMES

A thesis

submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Fellow

Programme in Management

Indian Institute of Management

Indore



By

Sanchita Roy Chowdhury

Date: 10.08.2022

Thesis Advisory Committee

Prof. Siddhartha K. Rastogi
[Chairman]

Prof. Ajay Sharma
[Member]

Prof. Deepak Sethia
[Member]

Abstract

Regional Trade Agreements (RTAs) have proliferated in the second half of the last century and covers majority of the world trade today. The World Trade Organization (WTO) facilitates the trade agreements to take place and provides various provisions covering environmental, labour, financial and social aspects in RTAs. Countries may include one or more of such provisions in their trade agreements, depending upon their needs. According to the participating countries' discretion, these provisions may be binding or non-binding.

Environmental issues have been a top priority globally in the last three decades. It is often argued that developed countries focus on greening the economy, but developing countries aim to grow the economy at the cost of the environment (Morin et. al., 2018). There have been several studies conducted which associate trade volume and pattern with the environment. But a few studies have related RTAs with environmental outcomes. The existing limited study which has related environmental provisions in RTAs with the environmental conditions in the past have mainly focused on emission of pollutants (Baghdadi et. al., 2013; Martinez-Zarzoso et. al., 2016; Zhou, et. al., 2017). No studies have been conducted on other sources of environmental pollution. In our first study, we aim to bridge this gap in literature. We carry out an analysis to directly relate the impact of including environmental provisions in RTAs on various environmental factors, such as rate of tree cover loss, use of fossil fuel, number of marine protected areas, and number of terrestrial protected areas. We use country pair fixed effects model to carry out our analysis.

Our results indicate that inclusion of environmental provision in RTAs are partially beneficial. It causes convergence between country pairs in terms of tree cover loss and marine protected areas, but does not have a significant impact on fossil fuel consumption and terrestrial protected areas.

Labour issues has been another issue of global concern over the years. The International Labour Organisation (ILO) has undertaken various measures to prevent exploitation of the labour force for growing the economy. With the increase in the importance of labour issues globally, the literature relating labour standards and trade is also growing. With respect to ‘decent work’ agenda of ILO and trade, the existing studies primarily address two questions- Does inclusion of stringent labour laws and provisions impact trade intensity? and, does trade have any impact of the domestic labour market? Most of the studies try to empirically answer the former question (Brown, et. al., 1996; Maskus & Martin, 2001; Dehejia & Sammy, 2004) and a limited number of studies are conducted on the later question (Slaughter, 1998; Milner & Wright, 1998; Neumayer & de Soya, 2007). However, very few studies have till date addressed the impact of trade policies on labour standards. In our second study, we address the gap in literature pertaining to the labour market by studying the impact of including labour provision in RTAs on the exposure of workers to occupational carcinogens, occupational gases, fumes and particulate matter, and occupational noise.

From our analysis, we see that inclusion of labour provision in RTAs causes convergence in exposure to occupational carcinogens and occupational gases, fumes and particulate matter between countries. However, it does not impact exposure to occupational noise. Therefore, it can be concluded that inclusion of labour provisions in RTAs are partially beneficial.

Our results are in line with the results from literature. We find inclusion of provisions in the RTAs are largely beneficial. Our study is aimed for policy makers for taking holistic decisions while signing trade agreements, which helps both the environmental conditions and labour force.

Table of Contents

| Sl. No. | Title | Page No. |
|----------------|---|-----------------|
| 1. | Abstract | 2 |
| 2. | Acknowledgement | 4 |
| 3. | Tables of contents | 6 |
| 4. | List of Tables | 7 |
| 5. | List of Figures | 8 |
| 6. | Chapter 1: Introduction | 9 |
| 7. | Chapter 2: Linkage Between Environmental Provisions in Regional Trade Agreements and Environmental Outcomes | 21 |
| 8. | Chapter 3: Linkage Between Labour Provisions in Regional Trade Agreements and Labour Market Outcomes | 59 |
| 9. | Chapter 4: Conclusion | 93 |
| 10. | Appendix | 100 |

List of tables

| Sl. No. | Title | Page No. |
|----------------|---|-----------------|
| 1. | Determination of binding and non-binding environmental contracts | 30 |
| 2. | Descriptive statistic | 39 |
| 3. | Convergence of environmental factors with RTAs and inclusion of environmental provisions | 44 |
| 4. | Convergence of environmental factors with RTAs and inclusion of binding environmental provisions | 49 |
| 5. | Absolute change in environmental factors with signing RTAs and inclusion of an environmental provision | 52 |
| 6. | Word clusters for determination of binding and non-binding contracts | 68 |
| 7. | Descriptive statistic | 77 |
| 8. | Convergence of occupational hazards with RTAs and inclusion of labour provisions | 82 |
| 9. | Convergence of occupational hazards with RTAs and inclusion of binding labour provisions | 84 |
| 10. | Absolute change in exposure to occupational hazards with signing RTAs and inclusion of labour provision | 86 |

List of figures

| Sl. No. | Title | Page No. |
|----------------|--|-----------------|
| 1. | Types of trade agreement | 10 |
| 2. | Number of RTAs that came into force year-wise (1948 to 2022) | 12 |
| 3. | Number of RTAs which came into force from 1990-2021 | 13 |
| 4. | Hypotheses development | 28 |
| 5. | Possible endogeneity among variables | 33 |
| 6. | Number of RTAs with/ without environmental provisions | 35 |
| 7. | Number of RTAs with binding and non-binding environmental provisions | 36 |
| 8. | RTAs with and without environment provisions based on country groups | 37 |
| 9. | RTAs with and without binding environmental provisions based on country groups | 38 |
| 10. | Diagrammatic representation of endogeneity among variables | 69 |
| 11. | Number of RTAs with and without labour provisions | 73 |
| 12. | Number of RTAs with binding and non-binding labour provisions | 74 |
| 13. | RTAs with and without labour provisions based on country group | 75 |
| 14. | RTAs with and without binding labour provisions based on country groups | 76 |

References

Bhagwati, J. N. (1995). US trade policy: The infatuation with FTAs.

Copeland, B. R. (2000). Trade and environment: policy linkages. *Environment and Development Economics*, 5(4), 405-432.

Jinnah, S., & Lindsay, A. (2016). Diffusion through issue linkage: Environmental norms in US trade agreements. *Global Environmental Politics*, 16(3), 41-61.

Häberli, Christian M, Hansen M, & Monteiro JA (2012) Regional Trade Agreements and Domestic Labour Market Regulation. *International Labour Office Employment Sector Working Paper Series* (Working Paper 120)

Hollway, J., Morin, J. F., & Pauwelyn, J. (2020). Structural conditions for novelty: the introduction of new environmental clauses to the trade regime complex. *International Environmental Agreements: Politics, Law and Economics*, 20(1), 61-83.

Kamata, Isao (2016): Labour Clauses in Regional Trade Agreements and Effects on Labor Conditions: An Empirical Analysis, *Institute of Developing Economics, IED Discussion Paper No. 609. Kobe University, Japan*

Lechner, L. (2016). The domestic battle over the design of non-trade issues in preferential trade agreements. *Review of International Political Economy*, 23(5), 840-871.

Martinez-Zarzoso, I., & Kruse, H. W. (2019). Are Labour Provisions in Free Trade Agreements Improving Labour Conditions?. *Open Economies Review*, 30(5), 975-1003.

Reppelin-Hill, V. (1999). Trade and environment: An empirical analysis of the technology effect in the steel industry. *Journal of Environmental Economics and Management*, 38(3), 283-301.

Stewart, R. B. (1992). International Trade and Environment: Lessons from the Federal Experience. *Wash. & Lee L. Rev.*, 49, 1329.

Temurshoev, U. (2006). Pollution haven hypothesis or factor endowment hypothesis: theory and empirical examination for the US and China. *CERGE-EI Working Paper*, (292).

Tsurumi, T., & Managi, S. (2014). The effect of trade openness on deforestation: empirical analysis for 142 countries. *Environmental Economics and Policy Studies*, 16(4), 305-324.

Wooldridge, J. M. (2012). Introductory econometrics: a modern approach. *Southwestern College Publishing*, Nashville.

Zhou, L., Tian, X. & Zhou, Z. (2017) The effects of environmental provisions in RTAs on PM2.5 air pollution. *Applied Economics*, 49:27, 2630-264

References

- Abman, R., & Lundberg, C. (2020). Does Free Trade Increase Deforestation? The Effects of Regional Trade Agreements. *Journal of the Association of Environmental and Resource Economists*, 7(1), 35-72.
- Badinger H (2008) Trade policy and productivity. *Eur Econ Rev* 52:867–891
- Baghdadi, L., Martinez-Zarzoso, I., & Zitouna, H. (2013). Are RTA agreements with environmental provisions reducing emissions?. *Journal of International Economics*, 90(2), 378-390.
- Baier SL, Bergstrand JH (2004) Economic determinants of free trade agreements. *J Int Econ* 64(1):29–63
- Brown, K., Adger, W. N., Tompkins, E., Bacon, P., Shim, D., & Young, K. (2001). Trade-off analysis for marine protected area management. *Ecological Economics*, 37(3), 417-434.
- Copeland, B., Gulati, S. (2006), Trade and the environment in developing countries. In: López, R., Toman, M., editors. *Economic Development and Environmental Sustainability*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. p178-216.
- Copeland, B.R., Taylor, M.S., 2003. *Trade and the Environment: Theory and Evidence*. Princeton University Press, Princeton, NJ.
- Faria, W. R., & Almeida, A. N. (2016). Relationship between openness to trade and deforestation: Empirical evidence from the Brazilian Amazon. *Ecological Economics*, 121, 85-97.
- Grossman, G. M., and A. B. Krueger (1991). “Environmental impacts of a North American Free Trade Agreement.” *NBER Working Paper*, No. 3914.

- Khandker, S., B. Koolwal, G., & Samad, H. (2009). *Handbook on impact evaluation: quantitative methods and practices*. The World Bank.
- Kibria, A., Akhundjanov, S. B., & Oladi, R. (2019). Fossil fuel share in the energy mix and economic growth. *International Review of Economics & Finance*, 59, 253-264.
- Kwakwa, P. A., Adu, G., & Osei-Fosu, A. K. (2018). A time series analysis of fossil fuel consumption in Sub-Saharan Africa: evidence from Ghana, Kenya and South Africa. *International Journal of Sustainable Energy Planning and Management*, 17, 31-44.
- Ma, C., Zhang, X., Chen, W., Zhang, G., Duan, H., Ju, M., ... & Yang, Z. (2013). China's special marine protected area policy: trade-off between economic development and marine conservation. *Ocean & coastal management*, 76, 1-11.
- Martínez-Zarzoso, I., & Oueslati, W. (2018). Do deep and comprehensive regional trade agreements help in reducing air pollution?. *International Environmental Agreements: Politics, Law and Economics*, 18(6), 743-777.
- Martin, S., Mees, C., Edwards, C., & Nelson, L. (2011, November). A preliminary investigation into the effects of Indian Ocean MPAs on yellowfin tuna, *Thunnus albacares*, with particular emphasis on the IOTC closed area. In *IOTC Proceedings*.
- Martínez-Zarzoso, I., Vidovic, M., & Voicu, A. (2016). Are the central east European countries pollution havens? *The Journal of Environment and Development*, 26, 25–50.
- Martínez-Zarzoso, Maurotti, (2011). The impact of urbanization on CO₂ emissions: evidence from developing countries. *Ecological Economics* 70, 1344–1353.
- Morin, JF, A Dür, L. Lechner, (2018). "Mapping the Trade and Environment Nexus: Insights from a New Dataset". *Global Environmental Politics*, vol. 18(1).

Mukhopadhyay, K., & Chakraborty, D. (2006). Pollution haven and factor endowment hypotheses revisited: evidence from India. *Journal of Quantitative Economics*, 4(1), 111-132.

Pendrill, F., Persson, U. M., Godar, J., & Kastner, T. (2019). Deforestation displaced: trade in forest-risk commodities and the prospects for a global forest transition. *Environmental Research Letters*, 14(5), 055003.

Pendrill, F., Persson, U. M., Godar, J., Kastner, T., Moran, D., Schmidt, S., & Wood, R. (2019). Agricultural and forestry trade drives large share of tropical deforestation emissions. *Global environmental change*, 56, 1-10.

Porter, M. E., & Van der Linde, C. (1995). Toward a new conception of the environment-competitiveness relationship. *Journal of economic perspectives*, 9(4), 97-118.

Schulze, K., Knights, K., Coad, L., Geldmann, J., Leverington, F., Eassom, A., ... & Burgess, N. D. (2018). An assessment of threats to terrestrial protected areas. *Conservation Letters*, 11(3), e12435.

Stern, D. I. (2007). The effect of NAFTA on energy and environmental efficiency in Mexico. *The Policy Studies Journal*, 35(2), 291–322.

Taylor, S.M., 2004. Unbundling the pollution haven hypothesis. *Advances in Economic Analysis and Policy* 4 (2).

Temurshoev, U. (2006). Pollution haven hypothesis or factor endowment hypothesis: theory and empirical examination for the US and China. *CERGE-EI Working Paper*, (292).

Tsurumi, T., & Managi, S. (2014). The effect of trade openness on deforestation: empirical analysis for 142 countries. *Environmental Economics and Policy Studies*, 16(4), 305-324.

Wooldridge, J. M. (2012). Introductory econometrics: a modern approach. *Southwestern College Publishing*, Nashville.

Zhou, L., Tian, X. & Zhou, Z. (2017) The effects of environmental provisions in RTAs on PM2.5 air pollution. *Applied Economics*, 49:27, 2630-2641.

References

- Abramovitz, M. (1986). "Catching Up, Forging Ahead, and Falling Behind," *Journal of Economic History* 46, 385–406.
- Badinger H (2008) Trade policy and productivity. *Eur Econ Rev* 52:867–891
- Baier SL, Bergstrand JH (2004) Economic determinants of free trade agreements. *J Int Econ* 64(1):29–63
- Brown, D. K., Deardorff, A. V., & Stern, R. M. (1993). *International labor standards and trade: a theoretical analysis* (Vol. 333). USA: Institute of Public Policy Studies, University of Michigan.
- Busse, M. (2004). On the determinants of core labour standards: the case of developing countries. *Economics Letters*, 83(2), 211-217.
- Carey, R. N., Driscoll, T. R., Peters, S., Glass, D. C., Reid, A., Benke, G., & Fritschi, L. (2014). Estimated prevalence of exposure to occupational carcinogens in Australia (2011–2012). *Occupational and environmental medicine*, 71(1), 55-62.
- Dehejia, V. H., & Samy, Y. (2008). Labor standards and economic integration in the European Union: an empirical analysis. *Journal of economic integration*, 817-847.
- De Matteis, S., Consonni, D., Lubin, J. H., Tucker, M., Peters, S., Vermeulen, R. C., ... & Landi, M. T. (2012). Impact of occupational carcinogens on lung cancer risk in a general population. *International journal of epidemiology*, 41(3), 711-721.
- Fang, S. C., Cassidy, A., & Christiani, D. C. (2010). A systematic review of occupational exposure to particulate matter and cardiovascular disease. *International journal of environmental research and public health*, 7(4), 1773-1806.

GBD (2019), “Global Burden of Disease Study 2019 Results”, *Institute for Health Metrics and Evaluation*, Seattle, United States.

Geschke, A. (2017). Calculating the cost of trade. In *The Social Effects of Global Trade* (pp. 33-48). *Jenny Stanford Publishing*.

Görg, H., & Görlich, D. (2011). Trade and labour market outcomes in Germany (No. 125). *OECD Publishing*.

Helpman, E., & Itskhoki, O. (2010). Labour market rigidities, trade and unemployment. *The Review of Economic Studies*, 77(3), 1100-1137.

Herr, H., & Scherrer, C. (2017). Trade, global value chains and working conditions. *Who Benefit from Trade*.

Huberman, M., & Lewchuk, W. (2003). European economic integration and the labour compact, 1850–1913. *European Review of Economic History*, 7(1), 3-41.

International Labour Organization. (1998). ILO declaration on fundamental principles and rights at work and its follow-up. *International Labour Organization*.

Kamata, I. (2014). Regional Trade Agreements with Labor Clauses: Effects on labor standards and trade. *La Follette School of Public Affairs Working Paper Series*, (2014-002).

Kamata, I. (2016). *Labor clauses in regional trade agreements and effects on labor conditions: An empirical analysis*. Institute of Developing Economies (IDE).

Khandker, S., B. Koolwal, G., & Samad, H. (2009). *Handbook on impact evaluation: quantitative methods and practices*. The World Bank.

- Lim, L. K., & McAleer, M. (2004). Convergence and catching up in ASEAN: a comparative analysis. *Applied Economics*, 36(2), 137-153.
- McNamara, C., & Labonté, R. (2017). Trade, labour markets and health: A prospective policy analysis of the Trans-Pacific Partnership. *International Journal of Health Services*, 47(2), 277-297.
- Martin, W., & Maskus, K. E. (2001). Core labor standards and competitiveness: implications for global trade policy. *Review of International Economics*, 9(2), 317-328.
- Martinez-Zarzoso, I., & Kruse, H. W. (2019). Are Labour Provisions in Free Trade Agreements Improving Labour Conditions?. *Open Economies Review*, 30(5), 975-1003.
- McDonald, N., & Ronayne, T. (1989). Jobs and their environment: the psychological impact of work in noise. *The Irish Journal of Psychology*, 10(1), 39-55.
- Melamed, S., Fried, Y., & Froom, P. (2001). The interactive effect of chronic exposure to noise and job complexity on changes in blood pressure and job satisfaction: a longitudinal study of industrial employees. *Journal of occupational health psychology*, 6(3), 182.
- Milner, C., & Wright, P. (1998). Modelling labour market adjustment to trade liberalisation in an industrialising economy. *The Economic Journal*, 108(447), 509-528.
- Neumeyer, E., & de Soysa, I. (2007). Globalization, women's economic rights and forced labor. *World Economy*, 33(1), 43-63.
- Orbie, J., Van den Putte, L., & Martens, D. (2017). The impact of labour rights commitments in EU trade agreements: The case of Peru. *Politics and Governance*, 5(4), 6-18.

Slaughter, M. J. (1998). International trade and labour-market outcomes: Results, questions, and policy options. *The Economic Journal*, 108(450), 1452-1462.

Taskin, F., & Zaim, O. (1997). Catching-up and innovation in high-and low-income countries. *Economics letters*, 54(1), 93-100.

Verspagen, B. (1991). A new empirical approach to catching up or falling behind. *Structural change and economic dynamics*, 2(2), 359-380.

Wooldridge, J. M. (2012). Introductory econometrics: a modern approach. *Southwestern College Publishing*, Nashville.

WTI, Haberli, C., ILO, Jansen, M., & Monteiro, J. A. (2012). Regional trade agreements and domestic labour market regulation. *Policy priorities for international trade and jobs*, 287.

Zhou, L., Tian, X., & Zhou, Z. (2017). The effects of environmental provisions in RTAs on PM_{2.5} air pollution. *Applied Economics*, 49(27), 2630-2641.

Appendix

Appendix-1: The equations for instrumental variables

We use the following equation to predict the income in the current period for each of the countries:

$$\ln GDP_{pc_{it}} = \alpha_i + \beta_1 \ln pop_{it} + \beta_2 \ln GDP_{pc_{it-1}} + \beta_3 \ln \left(\frac{I}{GDP}\right)_{it} + \beta_4 \ln s1_{it} + \beta_5 \ln s2_{it} + \beta_6 gr_{it} + \mu_{it} \dots\dots\dots (4)$$

Where, $GDP_{pc_{it-1}}$ is the lagged income of the previous period, I/GDP is the investment as a ratio of income, $s1$ is the rate of primary school enrolment, $s2$ is the rate of secondary school enrolment, gr is the population growth rate.

The trade openness and bilateral trade flows can be determined by the gravity model. Following Badinger's (2008) gravity model, trade between two countries is positively influenced by population size, the income or GDP of the country, the land area and negatively influenced by the geographical distance and the cultural distance or the language spoken in the two countries. Therefore, the variable openness is predicted using regression with bilateral trading ((import+export)/total GDP) as a dependent variable and population, land area, distance, landlocked dummy, similarity in country size and remoteness of the country. We determine remoteness as determined by creating a dummy which takes a value of 0 if the countries are in the same continent, else 1 and then multiplying the dummy with the log of the average value of the mean distance of the two countries from all other countries.

$$\ln btr_{ijt} = a_i + b_j + c_t + \beta_1 \ln pop_{it} + \beta_2 \ln pop_{jt} + \beta_3 \ln dist_{jit} + \beta_4 \ln ar_{ij} + \beta_5 \ln lang_{ij} + \beta_6 bor_{ij} + \beta_7 lndlck_{ij} + \beta_8 \left| \ln \left(\frac{landpc_{it}}{landpc_{jt}} \right) \right| + \beta_6 rmt_{ij} + \mu_{ijt} \dots\dots\dots (5)$$

Where, $dist$ is the distance between the capitals of the two countries, ar_{ij} is the area of i multiplied by the area of j , $lang$ is a dummy variable which takes a value 1 if the two countries have one common official language, $landck$ is a dummy variable which takes a value of 1 if either of the countries is land-locked, bor is a dummy variable which takes a value of 1 if the countries share a border, rmt is the remoteness of the country.

$$rmt_{ij} = 0.5com_{ij} \left\{ \left[\ln \left(\sum_{k=1, k \neq j}^N \frac{dis_{ik}}{(N-1)} \right) \right] + \left[\ln \left(\sum_{k=1, k \neq i}^N \frac{dis_{kj}}{(N-1)} \right) \right] \right\} \dots\dots\dots (6)$$

Com is a common continent dummy variable that takes a value of 0 if both country i and j are located in the same continent, else 1. Dis refers to the distance of countries i and j from all other countries except each other.

The variable trade openness is determined by aggregating the predicted bilateral trade variable.

$$opn_{it} = \sum_j exp[btr_{ijt}] \dots\dots\dots (7)$$

Appendix-2: List of RTAs between 2000 to 2018

| RTA Name | Type | Date of entry into force |
|---|-------------|---------------------------------|
| Comprehensive and Progressive Agreement for Trans-Pacific Partnership (CPTPP) | FTA & EIA | 30-Dec-18 |
| EU – Armenia | EIA | 1-Jun-18 |
| EFTA – Philippines | FTA & EIA | 1-Jun-18 |
| China – Georgia | FTA & EIA | 1-Jan-18 |
| El Salvador – Ecuador | PSA | 16-Nov-17 |
| Hong Kong, China - Macao, China | FTA & EIA | 27-Oct-17 |
| Turkey – Singapore | FTA & EIA | 1-Oct-17 |
| EU – Canada | FTA & EIA | 21-Sep-17 |
| Southern Common Market (MERCOSUR) – Egypt | FTA | 1-Sep-17 |
| EFTA – Georgia | FTA & EIA | 1-Sep-17 |
| Canada – Ukraine | FTA | 1-Aug-17 |
| Peru – Honduras | FTA & EIA | 1-Jan-17 |
| EU – Ghana | FTA | 15-Dec-16 |
| Turkey - Moldova, Republic of | FTA | 1-Nov-16 |
| EU – SADC | FTA | 10-Oct-16 |
| Eurasian Economic Union (EAEU) - Viet Nam | FTA & EIA | 5-Oct-16 |
| EU - Côte d'Ivoire | FTA | 3-Sep-16 |

| | | |
|--|-----------|-----------|
| Costa Rica – Colombia | FTA & EIA | 1-Aug-16 |
| Korea, Republic of – Colombia | FTA & EIA | 15-Jul-16 |
| Japan – Mongolia | FTA & EIA | 7-Jun-16 |
| Pacific Alliance | FTA & EIA | 1-May-16 |
| Southern Common Market (MERCOSUR) - Southern African Customs Union (SACU) | PSA | 1-Apr-16 |
| Korea, Republic of - Viet Nam | FTA & EIA | 20-Dec-15 |
| China - Korea, Republic of | FTA & EIA | 20-Dec-15 |
| Australia – China | FTA & EIA | 20-Dec-15 |
| Korea, Republic of - New Zealand | FTA & EIA | 20-Dec-15 |
| Chile – Thailand | FTA & EIA | 5-Nov-15 |
| Turkey – Malaysia | FTA | 1-Aug-15 |
| Mexico – Panama | FTA & EIA | 1-Jul-15 |
| Japan – Australia | FTA & EIA | 15-Jan-15 |
| Canada - Korea, Republic of | FTA & EIA | 1-Jan-15 |
| EFTA - Bosnia and Herzegovina | FTA | 1-Jan-15 |
| Eurasian Economic Union (EAEU) | CU & EIA | 1-Jan-15 |
| Korea, Republic of – Australia | FTA & EIA | 12-Dec-14 |
| Hong Kong, China – Chile | FTA & EIA | 9-Oct-14 |
| Canada – Honduras | FTA & EIA | 1-Oct-14 |
| EU – Georgia | FTA & EIA | 1-Sep-14 |
| EU - Moldova, Republic of | FTA & EIA | 1-Sep-14 |
| EFTA - Central America (Costa Rica and Panama) | FTA & EIA | 19-Aug-14 |

| | | |
|---|-----------|-----------|
| EU – Cameroon | FTA | 4-Aug-14 |
| Iceland – China | FTA & EIA | 1-Jul-14 |
| Switzerland – China | FTA & EIA | 1-Jul-14 |
| EU – Ukraine | FTA & EIA | 23-Apr-14 |
| Singapore - Chinese Taipei | FTA & EIA | 19-Apr-14 |
| Chile - Viet Nam | FTA | 1-Jan-14 |
| New Zealand - Chinese Taipei | FTA & EIA | 1-Dec-13 |
| Asia Pacific Trade Agreement (APTA) | PSA & EIA | 7-Sep-13 |
| Indonesia – Pakistan | PSA | 1-Sep-13 |
| Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) - Singapore | FTA & EIA | 1-Sep-13 |
| EU - Central America | FTA & EIA | 1-Aug-13 |
| Costa Rica - Singapore | FTA & EIA | 1-Jul-13 |
| Costa Rica - Peru | FTA & EIA | 1-Jun-13 |
| Turkey - Mauritius | FTA | 1-Jun-13 |
| Korea, Republic of - Turkey | FTA | 1-May-13 |
| Canada - Panama | FTA & EIA | 1-Apr-13 |
| EU - Colombia and Peru | FTA & EIA | 1-Mar-13 |
| Malaysia - Australia | FTA & EIA | 1-Jan-13 |
| Ukraine - Montenegro | FTA & EIA | 1-Jan-13 |
| United States - Panama | FTA & EIA | 31-Oct-12 |
| Chile - Nicaragua (Chile - Central America) | FTA & EIA | 19-Oct-12 |
| Canada - Jordan | FTA | 1-Oct-12 |
| EFTA - Hong Kong, China | FTA & EIA | 1-Oct-12 |

| | | |
|---|-----------|-----------|
| Treaty on a Free Trade Area between members of the Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS) | FTA | 20-Sep-12 |
| Mexico - Central America | FTA & EIA | 1-Sep-12 |
| EFTA - Montenegro | FTA | 1-Sep-12 |
| El Salvador - Cuba | PSA | 1-Aug-12 |
| EFTA - Ukraine | FTA & EIA | 1-Jun-12 |
| United States - Colombia | FTA & EIA | 15-May-12 |
| EU - Eastern and Southern Africa States | FTA | 14-May-12 |
| Panama - Peru | FTA & EIA | 1-May-12 |
| Korea, Republic of - United States | FTA & EIA | 15-Mar-12 |
| Japan - Peru | FTA & EIA | 1-Mar-12 |
| Chile - Malaysia | FTA | 25-Feb-12 |
| Peru - Mexico | FTA & EIA | 1-Feb-12 |
| Canada - Colombia | FTA & EIA | 15-Aug-11 |
| China - Costa Rica | FTA & EIA | 1-Aug-11 |
| India - Japan | FTA & EIA | 1-Aug-11 |
| Peru - Korea, Republic of | FTA & EIA | 1-Aug-11 |
| EFTA - Colombia | FTA & EIA | 1-Jul-11 |
| India - Malaysia | FTA & EIA | 1-Jul-11 |
| EU - Korea, Republic of | FTA & EIA | 1-Jul-11 |
| EFTA - Peru | FTA | 1-Jul-11 |
| Turkey - Chile | FTA | 1-Mar-11 |
| Hong Kong, China - New Zealand | FTA & EIA | 1-Jan-11 |
| EFTA - Albania | FTA | 1-Nov-10 |

| | | |
|--|-----------|-----------|
| EFTA - Serbia | FTA | 1-Oct-10 |
| Turkey - Serbia | FTA & EIA | 1-Sep-10 |
| New Zealand - Malaysia | FTA & EIA | 1-Aug-10 |
| East African Community (EAC) | CU & EIA | 1-Jul-10 |
| Mexico - Bolivia, Plurinational State of | PSA | 7-Jun-10 |
| ASEAN Free Trade Area (AFTA) | FTA | 17-May-10 |
| Chile - Guatemala (Chile - Central America) | FTA & EIA | 23-Mar-10 |
| Turkey - Montenegro | FTA | 1-Mar-10 |
| Peru - China | FTA & EIA | 1-Mar-10 |
| EU - Serbia | FTA & EIA | 1-Feb-10 |
| ASEAN - Korea, Republic of | FTA & EIA | 1-Jan-10 |
| ASEAN - India | FTA & EIA | 1-Jan-10 |
| Korea, Republic of - India | FTA & EIA | 1-Jan-10 |
| ASEAN - Australia - New Zealand | FTA & EIA | 1-Jan-10 |
| Southern Common Market (MERCOSUR) - Israel | FTA | 23-Dec-09 |
| EU - Pacific States | FTA | 20-Dec-09 |
| Panama - Nicaragua (Panama - Central America) | FTA & EIA | 21-Nov-09 |
| Colombia - Northern Triangle (El Salvador, Guatemala, Honduras) | FTA & EIA | 12-Nov-09 |
| India - Nepal | PSA | 27-Oct-09 |
| Japan - Viet Nam | FTA & EIA | 1-Oct-09 |
| Japan - Switzerland | FTA & EIA | 1-Sep-09 |
| Canada - Peru | FTA & EIA | 1-Aug-09 |

| | | |
|--|-----------|-----------|
| Peru - Singapore | FTA & EIA | 1-Aug-09 |
| EFTA - Canada | FTA | 1-Jul-09 |
| Panama - Guatemala (Panama - Central America) | FTA & EIA | 20-Jun-09 |
| Southern Common Market (MERCOSUR) - India | PSA | 1-Jun-09 |
| Chile - Colombia | FTA & EIA | 8-May-09 |
| Australia - Chile | FTA & EIA | 6-Mar-09 |
| Peru - Chile | FTA & EIA | 1-Mar-09 |
| United States - Peru | FTA & EIA | 1-Feb-09 |
| Panama - Honduras (Panama - Central America) | FTA & EIA | 9-Jan-09 |
| China - Singapore | FTA & EIA | 1-Jan-09 |
| United States - Oman | FTA & EIA | 1-Jan-09 |
| EU - CARIFORUM States | FTA & EIA | 29-Dec-08 |
| Japan - Philippines | FTA & EIA | 11-Dec-08 |
| ASEAN - Japan | FTA | 1-Dec-08 |
| Panama - Costa Rica (Panama - Central America) | FTA & EIA | 23-Nov-08 |
| Turkey - Georgia | FTA | 1-Nov-08 |
| China - New Zealand | FTA & EIA | 1-Oct-08 |
| Brunei Darussalam - Japan | FTA & EIA | 31-Jul-08 |
| Chile - Honduras (Chile - Central America) | FTA & EIA | 19-Jul-08 |
| EU - Bosnia and Herzegovina | FTA & EIA | 1-Jul-08 |
| Japan - Indonesia | FTA & EIA | 1-Jul-08 |
| EFTA - SACU | FTA | 1-May-08 |
| Turkey - Albania | FTA | 1-May-08 |

| | | |
|---|-----------|-----------|
| Panama - Chile | FTA & EIA | 7-Mar-08 |
| El Salvador- Honduras - Chinese Taipei | FTA & EIA | 1-Mar-08 |
| EU - Montenegro | FTA & EIA | 1-Jan-08 |
| Nicaragua - Chinese Taipei | FTA & EIA | 1-Jan-08 |
| Pakistan - Malaysia | FTA & EIA | 1-Jan-08 |
| Mauritius - Pakistan | PSA | 30-Nov-07 |
| Japan - Thailand | FTA & EIA | 1-Nov-07 |
| Chile - Japan | FTA & EIA | 3-Sep-07 |
| Chile - India | PSA | 17-Aug-07 |
| EFTA - Egypt | FTA | 1-Aug-07 |
| Pakistan - China | FTA & EIA | 1-Jul-07 |
| Central European Free Trade Agreement (CEFTA) 2006 | FTA | 1-May-07 |
| Agadir Agreement | FTA | 27-Mar-07 |
| Egypt - Turkey | FTA | 1-Mar-07 |
| Turkey - Syria | FTA | 1-Jan-07 |
| EFTA - Lebanon | FTA | 1-Jan-07 |
| EU - Albania | FTA & EIA | 1-Dec-06 |
| Ukraine - Belarus | FTA | 11-Nov-06 |
| Iceland - Faroe Islands | FTA & EIA | 1-Nov-06 |
| Chile - China | FTA & EIA | 1-Oct-06 |
| EFTA - Korea, Republic of | FTA & EIA | 1-Sep-06 |
| United States - Bahrain | FTA & EIA | 1-Aug-06 |
| India - Bhutan | PSA | 29-Jul-06 |

| | | |
|--|-----------|-----------|
| Panama - Singapore | FTA & EIA | 24-Jul-06 |
| Japan - Malaysia | FTA & EIA | 13-Jul-06 |
| Guatemala - Chinese Taipei | FTA & EIA | 1-Jul-06 |
| Russian Federation - Serbia | FTA | 3-Jun-06 |
| Trans-Pacific Strategic Economic Partnership | FTA & EIA | 28-May-06 |
| Korea, Republic of - Singapore | FTA & EIA | 2-Mar-06 |
| Dominican Republic - Central America - United States Free Trade Agreement (CAFTA-DR) | FTA & EIA | 1-Mar-06 |
| South Asian Free Trade Agreement (SAFTA) | FTA | 1-Jan-06 |
| Turkey - Morocco | FTA | 1-Jan-06 |
| United States - Morocco | FTA & EIA | 1-Jan-06 |
| Southern Common Market (MERCOSUR) | CU & EIA | 7-Dec-05 |
| EU - Algeria | FTA | 1-Sep-05 |
| Jordan - Singapore | FTA & EIA | 22-Aug-05 |
| India - Singapore | FTA & EIA | 1-Aug-05 |
| Thailand - New Zealand | FTA & EIA | 1-Jul-05 |
| Turkey - Tunisia | FTA | 1-Jul-05 |
| Pakistan - Sri Lanka | FTA | 12-Jun-05 |
| Turkey - Palestine | FTA | 1-Jun-05 |
| EFTA - Tunisia | FTA | 1-Jun-05 |
| Ukraine - Moldova, Republic of | FTA | 19-May-05 |
| Japan - Mexico | FTA & EIA | 1-Apr-05 |
| ASEAN - China | FTA & EIA | 1-Jan-05 |
| Thailand - Australia | FTA & EIA | 1-Jan-05 |

| | | |
|---|-----------|-----------|
| United States - Australia | FTA & EIA | 1-Jan-05 |
| EFTA - Chile | FTA & EIA | 1-Dec-04 |
| India - Thailand | PSA | 1-Sep-04 |
| Mexico - Uruguay | FTA & EIA | 15-Jul-04 |
| Southern African Customs Union (SACU) | CU | 15-Jul-04 |
| EU - Egypt | FTA | 1-Jun-04 |
| Common Economic Zone (CEZ) | FTA | 20-May-04 |
| Korea, Republic of - Chile | FTA & EIA | 1-Apr-04 |
| Panama - Chinese Taipei | FTA & EIA | 1-Jan-04 |
| United States - Singapore | FTA & EIA | 1-Jan-04 |
| United States - Chile | FTA & EIA | 1-Jan-04 |
| GUAM | FTA & EIA | 10-Dec-03 |
| China - Macao, China | FTA & EIA | 17-Oct-03 |
| Singapore - Australia | FTA & EIA | 28-Jul-03 |
| Morocco - United Arab Emirates | FTA | 9-Jul-03 |
| Turkey - Bosnia and Herzegovina | FTA | 1-Jul-03 |
| China - Hong Kong, China | FTA & EIA | 29-Jun-03 |
| India - Afghanistan | PSA | 13-May-03 |
| Brazil - Mexico | PSA | 2-May-03 |
| Pacific Island Countries Trade Agreement (PICTA) | FTA | 13-Apr-03 |
| Panama - El Salvador (Panama - Central America) | FTA & EIA | 11-Apr-03 |
| EU - Lebanon | FTA | 1-Mar-03 |

| | | |
|--|-----------|-----------|
| EU - Chile | FTA & EIA | 1-Feb-03 |
| Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) | CU | 1-Jan-03 |
| EFTA - Singapore | FTA & EIA | 1-Jan-03 |
| Japan - Singapore | FTA & EIA | 30-Nov-02 |
| Canada - Costa Rica | FTA | 1-Nov-02 |
| EFTA - Jordan | FTA | 1-Sep-02 |
| Ukraine - Tajikistan | FTA | 11-Jul-02 |
| Caribbean Community and Common Market (CARICOM) | CU & EIA | 4-Jul-02 |
| European Free Trade Association (EFTA) | FTA & EIA | 1-Jun-02 |
| Chile - El Salvador (Chile - Central America) | FTA & EIA | 1-Jun-02 |
| EU - Jordan | FTA | 1-May-02 |
| EFTA - North Macedonia | FTA | 1-May-02 |
| EU - San Marino | CU | 1-Apr-02 |
| Chile - Costa Rica (Chile - Central America) | FTA & EIA | 15-Feb-02 |
| Armenia - Kazakhstan | FTA | 25-Dec-01 |
| United States - Jordan | FTA & EIA | 17-Dec-01 |
| Dominican Republic - Central America | FTA & EIA | 4-Oct-01 |
| Ukraine - North Macedonia | FTA | 5-Jul-01 |
| EFTA - Mexico | FTA & EIA | 1-Jul-01 |
| EU - North Macedonia | FTA & EIA | 1-Jun-01 |
| Mexico - Cuba | PSA | 28-Feb-01 |
| New Zealand - Singapore | FTA & EIA | 1-Jan-01 |

| | | |
|---|-----------|----------|
| Southern African Development Community (SADC) | FTA | 1-Sep-00 |
| Turkey - North Macedonia | FTA | 1-Sep-00 |
| EU - Mexico | FTA & EIA | 1-Jul-00 |
| Israel - Mexico | FTA | 1-Jul-00 |
| EU - Israel | FTA | 1-Jun-00 |
| India - Sri Lanka | FTA | 1-Mar-00 |
| EU - Morocco | FTA | 1-Mar-00 |
| Georgia - Turkmenistan | FTA | 1-Jan-00 |
| EU - South Africa | FTA | 1-Jan-00 |
| West African Economic and Monetary Union (WAEMU) | CU | 1-Jan-00 |

Source: WTO RTAIS database

Appendix-3: List of all the countries

| High Income | Middle income | | Low income | |
|----------------|---------------|------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------|
| USA | Mexico | Tunisia | Nicaragua | Pakistan |
| Canada | Panama | Egypt | Haiti | India |
| Greenland | Costa Rica | Jordan | Lesotho | Nepal |
| Iceland | Venezuela | Iraq | Madagascar | Bangladesh |
| France | Brazil | Iran | Mozambique | Bhutan |
| Finland | Chile | Turkmenistan | Zimbabwe | Myanmar |
| Sweden | Argentina | Kazakhstan | Zambia | Indonesia |
| Norway | Uruguay | Belarus | Angola | Mongolia |
| United Kingdom | South Africa | Latvia | Dominican Republic of Congo | Vietnam |
| Ireland | Gabon | Lithuania | Tanzania | Cambodia |
| Germany | Botswana | Bosnia and Herzegovina | Rwanda | Solomon islands |
| Netherlands | Oman | Albania | Uganda | Côte d'Ivoire |
| Denmark | Saudi Arabia | Romania | Kenya | Samoa |
| Belgium | Libya | Sri Lanka | Ethiopia | Moldova |
| Switzerland | Turkey | Papua New Guinea | Kenya | Malawi |
| Italy | Croatia | Philippines | Eritrea | |
| Austria | Hungary | China | Sudan | |
| Greece | Poland | Thailand | South Sudan | |

| | | | | |
|-------------------------|-----------------------|--|-----------------------------|--|
| Spain | Slovakia | Jamaica | Central African Republic | |
| Portugal | Czech Republic | Mauritius | Chad | |
| Israel | Lebanon | Bulgaria | Cameroon | |
| Cyprus | Estonia | Cape Verde | Nigeria | |
| United Arab Emirates | Malaysia | Argentina | Niger | |
| Qatar | Republic of Korea | Fiji | Benin | |
| Kuwait | Serbia | Trinidad and Tobago | Togo | |
| Japan | Kosovo | Dominica | Ghana | |
| Australia | Montenegro | Saint Vincent and the Grenadines | Liberia | |
| New Zealand | Guatemala | Vanuatu | Sierra Leone | |
| Hong kong | Belize | Tonga | Guinea | |
| Austria | El Salvador | Tuvalu | Senegal | |
| Brunei Darussalam | Honduras | | Mauritania | |
| Luxembourg | Cuba | | Mali | |
| Malta | Dominican Republic | | Yemen | |
| Slovak Republic | Colombia | | Azerbaijan | |

| | | | | |
|------------------------|----------|--|-----------------|--|
| Slovenia | Ecuador | | Armenia | |
| Singapore | Peru | | Ukraine | |
| Seychelles | Bolivia | | Uzbekistan | |
| Bahamas | Russia | | Kyrgyz republic | |
| Bahamas | Paraguay | | Tajikistan | |
| Antigua and Barbuda | Guyana | | Afghanistan | |

Source: World Bank (Year 2000 classification)

Appendix-4: Long run convergence of environmental factors with RTAs and inclusion of environmental provisions

| VARIABLES | (1) Fossil fuel | (2) Tree cover loss | (3) Marine protected areas | (4) Terrestrial protected areas |
|--|------------------------|------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------------------------|
| RTA _t | 0.0263*** (0.0075) | 0.0547*** (0.0202) | 0.0690*** (0.0243) | -0.0005 (0.0137) |
| EP _t | 0.0110 (0.0089) | 0.7679*** (0.0241) | -0.0234 (0.0291) | 0.0602*** (0.0164) |
| RTA _{t-1} | -0.0186** (0.0090) | -0.6536*** (0.0243) | 0.0042 (0.0292) | -0.0809*** (0.0165) |
| EP _{t-1} | 0.0063 (0.0090) | -0.3938*** (0.0243) | 0.0023 (0.0292) | 0.0705*** (0.0165) |
| RTA _{t-2} | -0.0335*** (0.0083) | 0.3084*** (0.0225) | -0.0638** (0.0271) | -0.1046*** (0.0153) |
| EP _{t-2} | 0.0216*** (0.0072) | -0.2294*** (0.0195) | -0.0765*** (0.0234) | 0.0571*** (0.0132) |
| RTA _{t-1} -RTA _t | - | - | - | - |
| EP _{t-1} -EP _t | - | - | - | - |
| RTA _{t-2} -RTA _{t-1} | - | - | - | - |
| EP _{t-2} -EP _{t-1} | - | - | - | - |
| Abs ln land per capita ratio | 0.2040*** (0.0045) | 0.2770*** (0.0122) | -0.0240 (0.0147) | 0.0403*** (0.0083) |
| Abs ln population ratio | -0.0502*** | -0.0162 | -0.0553*** | 0.0487*** |

| | | | | |
|-----------------------------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|
| | (0.0049) | (0.0132) | (0.0159) | (0.0090) |
| Abs ln rate of urbanization ratio | 0.0073*** | 0.0187*** | 0.0123*** | 0.0199*** |
| | (0.0008) | (0.0022) | (0.0027) | (0.0015) |
| Abs ln openness predicted ratio | -0.1869*** | 0.2423*** | 1.0245*** | 0.5765*** |
| | (0.0156) | (0.0422) | (0.0508) | (0.0287) |
| Abs ln GDP per capita predicted | 0.1277*** | -0.1631*** | -0.0509*** | -0.0033 |
| | (0.0027) | (0.0074) | (0.0089) | (0.0050) |
| Abs ln bilateral trade predicted | 0.2319*** | 0.0354** | -0.4137*** | 0.4651*** |
| | (0.0054) | (0.0145) | (0.0175) | (0.0099) |
| Time dummy | -0.0141*** | -0.0182*** | -0.0259*** | -0.0273*** |
| | (0.0002) | (0.0004) | (0.0005) | (0.0003) |
| Constant | -2.2213*** | 0.3057* | 5.1748*** | -4.3968*** |
| | (0.0586) | (0.1583) | (0.1906) | (0.1077) |
| Observations | 413,029 | 413,029 | 413,029 | 413,029 |
| R-squared | 0.1462 | 0.0251 | 0.0124 | 0.1459 |
| Number of country pairs | 26,171 | 26,171 | 26,171 | 26,171 |

Standard errors in parentheses

*** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1

Appendix-5: Long run convergence of occupational hazards with RTAs and inclusion of labour provisions

| VARIABLES | (1) Exposure to occu. PM/gases/fumes | (2) Exposure to occu. noise | (3) Exposure to occu. carcinogen |
|--|---|-----------------------------------|--|
| RTA _t | -0.0147*** (0.0030) | 0.0035 (0.0030) | -0.0175*** (0.0028) |
| LP _t | 0.0366*** (0.0039) | 0.0204*** (0.0039) | 0.0393*** (0.0037) |
| RTA _{t-1} | -0.0014 (0.0030) | -0.0107** (0.0042) | -0.0012 (0.0029) |
| LP _{t-1} | -0.0006 (0.0041) | 0.0023 (0.0056) | -0.0001 (0.0039) |
| RTA _{t-2} | 0.0043* (0.0023) | 0.0001 (0.0036) | 0.0066*** (0.0022) |
| LP _{t-2} | -0.0048 (0.0032) | 0.0110** (0.0050) | -0.0050* (0.0030) |
| RTA _{t-1} -RTA _t | - | - | - |
| LP _{t-1} -LP _t | - | - | - |
| RTA _{t-2} -RTA _{t-1} | - | - | - |
| LP _{t-2} -LP _{t-1} | - | - | - |
| Abs In land per capita ratio | 0.0147*** | 0.0068*** | -0.0016 |

| | | | |
|-----------------------------------|------------|------------|------------|
| | (0.0023) | (0.0019) | (0.0022) |
| Abs ln population ratio | 0.0002 | 0.0109*** | -0.0037 |
| | (0.0024) | (0.0018) | (0.0023) |
| Abs ln rate of urbanization ratio | -0.0001 | 0.0001 | -0.0005* |
| | (0.0003) | (0.0003) | (0.0003) |
| Abs ln openness predicted ratio | 0.0201** | 0.0009 | -0.0261*** |
| | (0.0079) | (0.0006) | (0.0075) |
| Abs ln GDP per capita predicted | 0.8711*** | 0.8767*** | 0.9034*** |
| | (0.0013) | (0.0013) | (0.0012) |
| Abs ln bilateral trade predicted | 0.0252*** | -0.0002 | 0.0030 |
| | (0.0028) | (0.0003) | (0.0026) |
| Time dummy | -0.0027*** | -0.0028*** | -0.0029*** |
| | (0.0001) | (0.0000) | (0.0001) |
| Constant | -0.4536*** | -0.1941*** | -0.2247*** |
| | (0.0292) | (0.0058) | (0.0277) |
| Observations | 248,316 | 228,830 | 245,724 |
| R-squared | 0.7100 | 0.7286 | 0.7420 |
| Number of country pairs | 21,756 | 22,144 | 21,452 |

Standard errors in parentheses

*** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1